

# Pramanavarttika: Reliable Cognizers

Term	Definition	Divisions	Illustration
<i>Reliable cognizer</i>	A new incontrovertible knower	<u>Actual:</u> (1) Direct reliable cognizer  2) Inferential reliable cognizer  <u>Terminological [see p.312]</u> (1) Reliable beings (2) Reliable speech (3) Reliable consciousnesses	<u>Actual</u> (1) The first moment of a clairvoyance that knows another's mind (2) An inference which realizes that sound is impermanent through the sign/reason of being a product  <u>Terminological</u> (1) The teacher Buddha (2) The wheel of doctrine of the four noble truths (3) A direct perceiver or an inference

## 1. Definitions

C: The definition of reliable cognizer cannot be posited.

D: Why?

C: It follows that the definition of reliable cognizer can be posited.

D: I accept.

C: Posit the definition of reliable cognizer.

D: The subject, a new incontrovertible knower.

C: It follows that the subject, a new incontrovertible knower, is the definition of a reliable cognizer.

D: I accept [that the definition of a reliable cognizer is a new incontrovertible knower].

## 2. Divisions

C: The [**terminological**] divisions of reliable cognizer cannot be posited.

D: Why?

C: It follows that the [**terminological**] divisions of reliable cognizer can be posited.

D: I accept.

C: Posit the [**terminological**] divisions of reliable cognizer.

D: The subjects, the three, reliable beings, reliable speech and reliable consciousnesses.

C: It follows that the subjects, the three, reliable beings, reliable speech and reliable consciousnesses, are the [**terminological**] divisions of reliable cognizer.

D: I accept.

## 3. Debating illustrations: *that which serves as a basis for illustrating the appropriate definiendum by way of its definition.*

C: An illustration of a reliable being cannot be posited.

D: Why?

C: It follows that an illustration of reliable being can be posited.

D: I accept.

C: Posit an illustration of reliable being.

D: The subject, the teacher Buddha.

C: It follows that the subject, the teacher Buddha, is an illustration of reliable being.

D: I accept.

# Consequences and Points of Clarification

After the Defender says, "The Reason is Not Established"

## EXAMPLE A: Whatever is consciousness is necessarily conceptual

D: I accept that whatever is consciousness is necessarily conceptual	
C: It follows that whatever is consciousness is necessarily conceptual	
D: I accept it	
C: It follows that the subject, an eye consciousnesses, is conceptual.	→ <u>FIRST CONSEQUENCE</u> → <b>FIRST POINT OF CLARIFICATION</b> Plain language: "NO! Then that would mean sense consciousnesses are conceptual!"
D: Why [is an eye consciousnesses conceptual]?	
C: Because of being consciousness, you asserted the pervasion [that whatever is consciousness is necessarily conceptual].	
D: The reason [that an eye consciousnesses is consciousness] is not established.	
C: It follows that the subject, an eye consciousnesses, is consciousness because of being <i>that which is clear and knowing</i> .	→ <u>SECOND CONSEQUENCE</u> → <b>NEW POINT OF CLARIFICATION</b> Plain language: "Well you see an eye consciousnesses is consciousness, because it fits the definition of consciousness: blah, blah..."

## EXAMPLE B: Whatever is a mental factor is necessarily virtuous

D: I accept that whatever is a mental factor is necessarily virtuous	
C: It follows that whatever is a mental factor is necessarily virtuous.	
D: I accept it	
C: It follows that the subject, anger, is virtuous.	→ <u>FIRST CONSEQUENCE</u> → <b>FIRST POINT OF CLARIFICATION</b> Plain language: "NO! Then that would mean anger is virtuous!"
D: Why [is anger virtuous]?	
C: Because of being a mental factor, you asserted the pervasion [that whatever is a mental factor is necessarily virtuous].	
D: The reason [that anger is mental factor] is not established.	
C: It follows that the subject, anger, is a mental factor because of being <i>a cognizer apprehending a particular quality of an object and arising in attendance upon a primary mind with which it has certain similarities</i> .	→ <u>SECOND CONSEQUENCE</u> → <b>NEW POINT OF CLARIFICATION</b> Plain language: "Well you see anger is a mental factor, because it fits the definition of mental factor: blah, blah..."

# Exploring the Dynamics of the Paramitas

## Debate Cheat Sheet

Term	Definition**	Divisions	Analogies
<i>Bodhicitta</i>	For the sake of others, wishing to attain complete, perfect enlightenment	(1) Wishing bodhicitta (2) Venturing bodhicitta	Supreme nectar Resting tree Butter essence from churned milk
<i>Equanimity</i>	An evenness of mind that enables us to be impartial, without being swayed by either attachment or antipathy	(1) Equanimity in the context of serenity (2) Equanimity in the context of neutral feelings (3) Equanimity in the context of impartiality	Impartial compassion for friend, enemies and strangers
<i>Generosity</i>	The practice of giving to others in need	(1) Generosity of material goods (2) Generosity of the Dharma (3) Generosity of protection from fear	Snake shedding its skin Stingy householder Reciting texts with compassion for others
<i>Ethical conduct</i>	The practice of removing negativities of body, speech and mind	(1) Ethic of restraint (2) Ethic of virtue (3) Ethic of altruism	Moisture that gathers and nurtures everything Lotus flower Frequent renunciation
<i>Fortitude</i>	Cultivating fortitude towards harms in general and hardships in accomplishing the welfare of others in particular	(1) Fortitude of practicing the Dharma (2) Fortitude of not retaliating (3) Fortitude of voluntarily enduring suffering	Earth Smith's anvil Fisherman, farmers etc. Trees A mouthful of food Eyes Sounding alerts
<i>Diligence</i>	The practice of taking delight in virtues and altruistic services	(1) Armor-like diligence (2) Practical diligence (3) Unrelenting diligence	Physicians and lotus Servant Ted-ted Arya Asanga's determination Water drops cut through rocks
<i>Concentration</i>	Cultivating unwavering concentration and one-pointed focus on altruistic services	(1) Discriminating concentration (2) Suchness oriented concentration (3) Unpolluted concentration	Clear water in a stainless container Elephant of the mind tied to the pole of mindfulness
<i>Wisdom</i>	The practice of seeing things as they ultimately are	(1) Wisdom arising from hearing (2) Wisdom arising from reflection (3) Wisdom arising from meditation	A person graced with vision A darkness-dispelling lamp

\*\*These may not be technical definitions, but are taken from Geshe Dadul's ppt presentation on this topic.

# Foundation of Buddhist Practice: The Basis of the Self

## Debate Cheat Sheet

Term	Definition	Divisions	Illustration
<i>Main mind</i>	A primary cognizer established by means of its apprehension of the entity (fundamental presence) of the object.	(1) Visual consciousness (2) Auditory consciousness (3) Olfactory consciousness (4) Gustatory consciousness (5) Tactile consciousness (6) Mental consciousness  OR (1) Sense Consciousness (2) Mental consciousness	<b>Give the definition of one of the main minds e.g. visual consciousness:</b> A knower produced in dependence upon its own uncommon empowering condition, the eye sense power, and an observed-object condition, a visual form [could give specific example here e.g. blue sky]
<i>Mental Factors</i>	A cognizer apprehending a particular quality of an object and arising in attendance upon a primary mind with which it has certain similarities.	(1) Omnipresent mental factors (2) Object-ascertaining mental factors (3) Virtuous mental factors (4) Root afflictions (5) Auxiliary afflictions (6) Changeable mental factors	<b>Give the definition of one of the mental factors: e.g. sleep</b> A cognizer that makes the mind unclear, gathers the sense consciousness inward, and renders the mind incapable of apprehending the body
<i>Virtuous Mental Factors</i>	Mental factors that cause the omnipresent, object-ascertaining, and variable mental factors to take on a virtuous aspect and bring peace to oneself and others.	<u>Eleven</u> : faith, integrity, consideration for others, nonattachment, nonhatred, nonconfusion, joyous effort, pliancy, conscientiousness, nonharmfulness, equanimity	<b>Give the definition of one of the virtuous mental factors e.g. conscientiousness:</b> The mental factor that values the accumulation of virtue and guards the mind against the afflictions
<i>Root Afflictions</i>	Distinct mental factors that, when they arise in one's mind, cause the mental continuum to be unpeaceful and unsubdued.	(1) Attachment (2) Anger (3) Arrogance (4) Ignorance (5) Deluded doubt (6) Afflictive Views	<b>Give the definition or an instance of one of the root afflictions e.g. anger</b> A cognizer that projects or exaggerates the unattractive qualities of an object or person, is unable to bear it, and wishes to harm or be free from it.

# SYLLOGISMS

FOR EACH EXAMPLE GIVE:

1. A correct reason i.e. reason **is** established AND the pervasion **works**
2. A reason that is **not** established, but the pervasion **works**
3. The reason **is** established, but the pervasion **does not work**
4. A reason that **is not** established, and the pervasion **does not work**

A. The subject, sound, is impermanent because it is...

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

E. The subject, a square circle, is not an existent because it is...

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

B. The subject, a person, is not form, because it is...

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

F. The subject, definition, is not a definition because it is...

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

C. The subject, impermanent phenomenon, existents because they are...

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

G. The subject, definiendum, is a definiendum because it is...

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

D. The subject, mental consciousness, is a cause because it is...

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

H. The subject, table, is different-from-sound because it is...

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

## Potential Answers...

- A. The subject, sound, is impermanent because it is...
  - 1. A momentary phenomenon [Think: qualities, synonyms or definitions of the predicate]
  - 2. An apple [Think: the pervasion works, but it's not the subject]
  - 3. An existent [Think: the reason is a bigger group than the predicate]
  - 4. A non-thing [Think: what would contradict both the subject and predicate?]
  
- B. The subject, a person, is not form, because it is...
  - 1. An abstract composite
  - 2. A consciousness
  - 3. An existent
  - 4. Form
  
- C. The subject, impermanent phenomena, are existents because...
  - 1. They are specifically characterized phenomena
  - 2. Phenomenon that is a non-thing
  - 3. Selfless
  - 4. Non-existents
  
- D. The subject, mental consciousness, is a cause because it is...
  - 1. A producer
  - 2. Form
  - 3. An existent
  - 4. A generally characterized phenomenon
  
- E. The subject, a square circle, is not an existent because it is...
  - 1. A non-existent
  - 2. Sky-flower
  - 3. Selfless
  - 4. A visual form
  
- F. The subject, definition, is not a definition because it is...
  - 1. A definiendum
  - 2. A consciousness
  - 3. Selfless
  - 4. A non-thing
  
- G. The subject, definiendum, is a definiendum because it is...
  - 1. That which is a triply qualified imputed existent
  - 2. Apple
  - 3. A functioning thing
  - 4. A non-existent
  
- H. The subject, table, is different-from-sound because it is...
  - 1. A phenomenon that is not the same in name and meaning as sound
  - 2. Non-table
  - 3. Impermanent
  - 4. Sound